

Gender and violence: an economic approach

NOVA
School
of Business
& Economics

Shaping
powerful
minds

Pedro Pita Barros

Motivation

- Why economic approach?
- Do economic conditions matter?
- Can economic reasoning help?
 - Empirical methodology
 - Theoretical methodology
- Follows from previous (small) contributions

- “Custos económicos de longo prazo da violência contra as mulheres” in Manuel Lisboa (coord.) “Prevenir ou Remediar – os custos sociais e económicos da violência contra as mulheres”, 2006
- Main implication – violence matters for long term employment, promotion and firing – these are long run economic costs.
- Only measured on domestic violence against women.

- “Health care costs of domestic violence against women – evidence from Portugal”, Pedro Barros, Manuel Lisboa, Eliana Barrenho, Dalila Cerejo
- Objective: estimate additional costs for the Portuguese National Health Service (NHS) due to domestic violence against women
- These are the short-run costs that complement the previous view

- The timeframe: all costs generated by domestic violence situations in the last twelve months
- Costs were estimated through the product of total number of episodes by the average estimated price per episode
- costs originated by income losses, the opportunity cost of time spent on health care treatments and the work inability caused by sickness

- five groups of costs were identified:
 - consultations,
 - medical treatments and therapies,
 - complementary and diagnostic exams,
 - drugs, and
 - transport costs
- Quantified according to the tables contained in *Portaria* No 110-A/2007 of 23 January (prices for acts)

	Domestic violence	Other violence	Non-victims
Total costs	826,52	856,15	640,51
Costs to women	171,52	182,19	120,53
Consultation costs	25,16	19,12	17,14
Costs of exams	12,58	16,20	11,56
Costs of treatments	5,40	1,82	1,85
Costs with drugs	72,50	87,32	56,29
Private expenditures	30,15	25,59	12,44
Transportation costs	25,74	32,14	21,66
Costs to the NHS	654,99	673,96	519,97
Consultation costs	368,18	280,55	264,93
Costs of exams	97,51	132,40	91,56
Costs of treatments	44,63	21,08	14,61
Costs of drugs	144,18	239,83	148,74
Transportation costs	0,49	0,11	0,13
Absenteeism costs	123,74	29,60	22,75
Number of observations	68	128	322

- Explore the differences across groups – direct effects
- Explain costs according to age group, level of schooling achieved, income bracket and age group of the partner
- Main result: non-significance of estimated coefficients associated with health care costs of victims of domestic violence
- Which was surprising!! But this is incomplete...

- Carmo (2006, p.83) finds essentially the same empirical evidence in the use of health care (although data came from a different survey):
“From a statistical point of view, we see that the probability of victims using [health care] is very similar to that of non-victims; therefore, it is not possible to establish a statistical relationship between the two phenomena
- So, shall we conclude that no extra costs exist?

- On the other hand, Vicente (2006, p. 97) using the same survey of Carmo (2006) concludes: “the impact of violence on the life of a person is not easy to qualify and quantify, given its wide range: emotional, behavioural, cognitive and physical. This being said, it will not be easy to estimate the associated costs.” Own translation.
- So where to look? How to explain? Or to accept?

- Hypothesis: impact of domestic violence will persist over time, spanning several years and one of its consequences is a lower level of health to women victims of domestic violence.
- This characteristic suggests that the effect of domestic violence on health care can be mainly a **mediated** effect, through lower health status. In turn, the lower health status translates into a higher utilization of health care

- One strategy to identify effects will follow a recursive structure
- Violence to lower health, lower health to high costs
- On average, women victims of violence do report a lower health status, once differences in age, income and schooling level have been controlled for.

- Mediated effects

	Domestic violence	Other violence	Average value to non-victims
Total costs	146,02€	154,26€	640,51€
Costs to women	18,80€	19,86€	120,53€
Costs to the NHS	127,21€	134,39€	519,97€
Absenteeism costs	—	—	22,75€

- New Survey “Inquérito Nacional Violência de Género” – 2007 – Manuel Lisboa & team
- Includes both men and women
- Detailed information

- Look again at long term effects of violence (whatever type)
- Probability of discrimination when looking for work
- Probit model – Women
 - 53 discriminated in 986, 815 valid observations
 - role of age, education, income, nationality and violence
 - Violence – the broad question in the survey
 - Foreign women are less likely to be discriminated, university education finds it more likely, reporting violence less likely

- Probit – men
 - Smaller number of valid observations (due to income variable to considerable extent)
 - Some question of discrimination
 - Different results:
 - Reported violence is associated with higher probability of discrimination
 - University education – reports higher probability of discrimination
 - High School – the same
 - No income effects

Lower wage effects

- Women – very small numbers are reported, 12 in 970
- Men – only 1 person reported lower age
- Does not seem to be a relevant economic effect

- For different types of violence, what factors are associated with it?
- Use probit model to see associations
- Differentiate between women and men

Screams and verbal threats (p2_10)

- Women – Divorced and living together (not married) less likely, high income more likely to report (note this is self-reporting, no control for reporting bias)
- Men – no age, no education, no income effects

Waked up during the night (p2_11)

- Women – negative age effect – less likely in older populations, more likely to be reported by high income women
- Men - no age, no education, no income effects

Other broke furniture to induce fear (p2_13)

- Women – negative association with divorced status (less likely to report), positive income effect
- Men – no age, no education, no income effects

Threats and blackmail (p2_17)

- Women – age effects – more likely at older ages; more likely with portuguese women; less likely with primary school education, less likely when divorced or widowed; no income effects
- Men – only negative association with older age (so, more likely at young ages)

Threats to family, friends or pets (p2_19)

- Women – positive age effect – more likely at older ages, income effect – more likely at high income levels
- Men – no effects from age, education, income

Threats to property (p2_21)

- Women – positive effect associated with age
- Men – no effects

Threats with guns (p2_22)

- Women – more likely with married women, less likely for women with basic schooling
- Men – no effects

Physical assault (p2_45)

- Women – low schooling is negatively associated (less likely); married women are more likely to show positive association
- Men – no effects from age, education, income

Physical assault 2 (p2_47)

- Women – married women are more likely to report it, high income women are more likely to report
- Men – no systematic effects associated with age, education, income

Burns and cuts (p2_51)

- Women – negative association of living together but not married
- Men – older ages are less likely to report

Throwing objects (p2_52)

- Women – only income effect, and higher income women are more likely to report it
- Men – no systematic effects

Being beaten (p2_54)

- Women – living together but not married and divorced less likely, higher income more likely to report
- Men – no systematic effects

Victim of any violence act? (p2_80)

- Women – women – high income increases the probability of reporting any sort of violence, divorced less likely to report but married more likely to report violence
- Men – only income is associated, and higher income decreases the probability of reporting this general indicator for violence.

Concluding remarks

- There are long run and short run economic costs associated with domestic violence against women
- The costs are mediated by lower health status (and not just immediate impact)
- Wider definition of violence and both men and women: positive income gradient; age gradient depends on type of violence; but difficult to find a pattern



-
- Comments, corrections and suggestions most welcome